

Evidence of Moonlighting

The following email was received from Clementine Churchill confirming that Miranda Harvie & Peter Schnatterbeck started sessions since 2006

The staff name has been taken off in order to protect the individual from persecution

Hotmail

New | Delete Junk | Mark as ▾ Move to ▾ |

Messenger ▾ | Op

sharmila.chowdhury@h

Reply Reply all Forward |

- Inbox (60)**
- Junk (1)
- Drafts (6)
- Sent
- Deleted (11)
- Manage folders
- Add an e-mail account
- Related places
- Today
- Contact list
- Calendar



Windows Live Hotmail
Share your story now

RE: radiologist sessions

From: [REDACTED] ([REDACTED]@bmihealthcare.co.uk)
 Sent: 11 February 2010 17:16:18
 To: sharmila chowdhury (sharmila.chowdhury@hotmail.co.uk)

Dear Sharmila,
 I will look up all the info and get back to you tomorrow. Both on them started with us in 2006. ✱

Kind regards,

[REDACTED]
 [REDACTED]
 Clementine Churchill Hospital
 Tel: 020 8872 [REDACTED]
 Fax: 020 8872 3901
 [REDACTED]@bmihealthcare.co.uk

From: sharmila chowdhury
 [mailto:sharmila.chowdhury@hotmail.co.uk]
Sent: 11 February 2010 08:53
To: [REDACTED]
Subject: radiologist sessions

Dear [REDACTED],

I wondered if you could provide me with some information as the Imaging Manger at Clementine Churchill.

We currently have 2 radiologists, Miranda Harvie and Peter Schnatterbeck, who are contracted to work at Ealing Hospital, who currently also undertake sessions at the Clementine.

Please could you let me know for Miranda and Peter:

1. The regular sessions currently undertaken at the Clementine
2. How long have these arrangements been in place

TRAV

THIS TOI

Released:

£49
Indulgent! Package in Treatment
 Dove Spa

£299
Exclusive: 5-Star All-In Break. £13
 Jetline Travel

£79
2-Night All UK Hotel B w/Unlimited
 hotelshopUK

£349
Deluxe Sic Half-Board OFF
 Hotelsbooked

Sign up

Over 1 UK sub

The following data was obtained from Clementine Churchill.

The data shows sessions to Clementine Churchill by Miranda Harvie and Peter Schnatterbeck in the previous 6 months on Mondays whilst being paid by Ealing Hospital NHS Trust.

Note: Miranda and Peter have been attending since 2006

Over 3.5 years at time of receiving this data

| <u>Date</u> | <u>Dr. M. Harvie</u> | <u>Dr. P. Schnatterbeck</u> |
|--------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|
| 6 th July 09 | PM | AM |
| 13 th July 09 | All Day | --- |
| 20 th July 09 | All Day | --- |
| 27 th July 09 | --- | AM |
| 3 rd Aug 09 | --- | AM |
| 10 th Aug 09 | --- | AM |
| 17 th Aug 09 | All Day | --- |
| 24 th Aug 09 | All Day | --- |
| 31 st Aug 09 | Bank Holiday | Bank Holiday |
| 7 th Sep 09 | PM | AM |
| 14 th Sep 09 | PM | AM |
| 21 st Sep 09 | All Day | --- |
| 28 th Sep 09 | All Day | --- |
| 5 th Oct 09 | PM | AM |
| 12 th Oct 09 | PM | AM |
| 19 th Oct 09 | All Day | AM |
| 26 th Oct 09 | PM | --- |
| 2 nd Nov 09 | PM | AM |
| 9 th Nov 09 | PM | AM |
| 16 th Nov 09 | --- | --- |
| 23 rd Nov 09 | All Day | --- |
| 30 th Nov 09 | PM | AM |
| 7 th Dec 09 | PM | AM |
| 14 th Dec 09 | All Day | --- |
| 4 th Jan 2010 | --- | All Day |

Compare this data with the weekly roster from Ealing Hospital.

Note: They were roistered and paid by Ealing Hospital whilst actually
Working at Clementine Churchill. So being paid twice.

MH not inc
↓

| Weekly Rota | Monday | Tuesday | Wednesday | Thursday | Friday |
|------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------------------------|---|------------------------|
| Date | 17/08/2009 | 18/08/2009 | 19/08/2009 | 20/08/2009 | 21/08/2009 |
| Duty Radiologist | am SB pm SB | am MH pm MH | am WB pm MH | am MH pm WB | am AR pm AR |
| CT | am SB pm MH | am AR pm AR | am WB pm MH | am MH pm WB | am AR pm SB |
| MRI | am MH pm AR (extra) | am AR pm MH | am WB pm MH (extra) | am MH pm AR (extra) | am SB (extra) pm SB |
| US | am AR pm AR | am WB pm WB | am SB WB pm SB WB | am AR pm AR | am AR pm WB |
| Reporting | am pm | am WB pm MH | am pm | am WB pm WB | am WB pm WB |
| Screening | am pm | am WB pm MH | am pm | am WB pm WB | am WB pm WB |
| Intervention | am pm | am WB pm Radiographer | am pm | am pm | am pm |
| SPA | WB | WB | AR | SB | MH |
| Teaching | | | | WB (pm) | |
| A/L or S/L | PS JS WC SF KR | PS JS WC SF KR SE | PS JS WC SF KR | PS JS WC SF KR | PS JS WC SF KR |
| MDT or ClinRad Meeting | Neuro 12.30 SB Upper GI 13.00 AR | Vascular 8.15 PS Lung 12.30 MH | Haematol 9.30 WC Gynae 12.30 MH | Urology 8.15 AR Colorectal 8.30 MH ITU 14.00 MH | Gen Med 13.00 AR |
| Dr Banavali | SB | Dr Harvie | MH | Dr Schnatterbeck | PS |
| Dr Bashir | WB | Dr Jelbert | AJ | Dr Stroudley | JS |
| Dr Curati | WC | Dr Rafique | AR | | |
| Dr Flais | SF | Dr Riahy (10 am) | KR | | |

MH not in

| Weekly Rota Date | Monday | Tuesday | Wednesday | Thursday | Friday |
|------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------------------------|---|------------------|
| | 24/08/2009 | 25/08/2009 | 26/08/2009 | 27/08/2009 | 28/08/2009 |
| Duty Radiologist | am KR pm SB | PS MH | SB MH | KR MH | AR SB |
| CT | am PS pm SB | MH KR | PS MH | MH AR | SB AR |
| MRI | am MH pm PS | AR SB | SB MH (extra) | PS PS | AR SB |
| US | am SB pm KR | SE AR | SB | AR KR | PS |
| Reporting | am KR pm KR | PS MH | | KR MH | KR KR |
| Screening | am Radiographer pm | | MH | | KR |
| Intervention | am pm | PS | | | |
| SPA | | | AR KR PS (pm) | SB | MH PS (pm) |
| Teaching | | | | | |
| A/L or S/L | JS WC SF WB AR | JS WC SF WB | JS WC SF WB | JS WC SF WB | JS WC SF WB |
| MDT or ClinRad Meeting | Neuro 12.30 SB Upper GI 13.00 AR | Vascular 8.15 PS Lung 12.30 MH | Haematol 9.30 WC Gynae 12.30 MH | Urology 8.15 AR Colorectal 8.30 MH ITU 14.00 MH | Gen Med 13.00 AR |

- | | | | | | |
|-------------|----|------------------|----|------------------|----|
| Dr Banavali | SB | Dr Harvie | MH | Dr Schnatterbeck | PS |
| Dr Bashir | WB | Dr Jelbert | AJ | Dr Stroudley | JS |
| Dr Curati | WC | Dr Rafique | AR | | |
| Dr Flais | SF | Dr Riahy (10 am) | KR | | |

As complaints regarding their attendances continued, Peter and Miranda were left off the roster whilst they were at Clementine Churchill.

They were still being paid for being at work on Mondays at Ealing and had not dropped any paid sessions

This was presumably done so prevent staff asking their whereabouts

NOTE: They were not on annual leave (A/L), study leave (S/L), teaching or on SPA days. They were not off sick either!!

Roster was produced by Dr Akkib Rafique

• PS not in AM
 Has been left off the roster. Where is he?

| Weekly Rota Date | Monday 07/09/2009 | Tuesday 08/09/2009 | Wednesday 09/09/2009 | Thursday 10/09/2009 | Friday 11/09/2009 |
|------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------------------------|---|----------------------|
| Duty Radiologist | am KR pm PS | MH MH | MH MH | KR AR | KR SB |
| CT | am MH pm SB | PS KR | SB MH | MH AR | SB KR |
| MRI | am SB pm AR | SB WC | SB (extra) MH (extra) | AR (extra) MH | SB (extra) SB |
| US | am AR pm KR | AR PS | JS SB | AR KR | JS KR |
| Reporting | am KR pm PS | MH KR MH SB | JS MH | KR JS | KR JS KR |
| Screening | am | | | | |
| Intervention | pm | AR | | | AR |
| SPA | | | AR KR | PS SB | MH |
| Teaching A/L or S/L | | | | WB | WB AR PS |
| MDT or ClinRad Meeting | Neuro 12.30 SB Upper GI 13.00 AR | Vascular 8.15 PS Lung 12.30 MH | Haematol 9.30 WC Gynae 12.30 MH | Urology 8.15 AR Colorectal 8.30 MH ITU 14.00 MH | Gen Med 13.00 AR |
| Dr Banavali | SB | Dr Harvie | MH | Dr Schnatterbeck | PS |
| Dr Bashir | WB | Dr Jelbert | AJ | Dr Stroudley | JS |
| Dr Curati | WC | Dr Rafique | AR | | |
| Dr Flais | SF | Dr Riahy (10 am) | KR | | |

PS off Monday AM
 Explains in PM

(Rostered for CT)
 ? where is he.

| Weekly Rota | Monday | Tuesday | Wednesday | Thursday | Friday |
|------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------------------------|---|------------------|
| Date | 14/09/2009 | 15/09/2009 | 16/09/2009 | 17/09/2009 | 18/09/2009 |
| Duty Radiologist | am KR pm PS | am MH pm PS | am PS pm MH | am KR pm AR | am KR pm SB |
| CT | am MH pm AR | am PS pm KR | am PS pm MH | am AR (extra) pm MH | am AR pm PS |
| MRI | am PS pm AR | am WC pm AR | am PS (extra) pm MH (extra) | am AR (extra) pm MH | am AR pm SB |
| US | am KR pm KR | am AR pm AR | am PS pm PS | am KR pm KR | am AR pm JS |
| Reporting | am KR pm PS | am MH pm MH | am WC pm MH | am JS pm JS | am KR pm JS |
| Screening | am | pm | | | |
| Intervention | am | pm PS | | | |
| SPA | | | AR KR | PS SB JS (pm) | MH |
| Teaching | | AR (1-2pm) | | | AR (1-2pm) |
| A/L or S/L | WB SB JS | WB SB JS | WB SB JS | WB | WB |
| MDT or ClinRad Meeting | Neuro 12.30 SB Upper GI 13.00 AR | Vascular 8.15 PS Lung 12.30 MH | Haematol 9.30 WC Gynae 12.30 MH | Urology 8.15 AR Colorectal 8.30 MH ITU 14.00 MH | Gen Med 13.00 AR |

Dr Baravali SB
 Dr Bashir WB
 Dr Curati WC
 Dr Flais SF

Dr Harvie MH
 Dr Jelbert AJ
 Dr Rafique AR
 Dr Riahy (10 am) KR

Dr Schnatterbeck PS
 Dr Stroudley JS

MM work in dept from
 off the rota pm = ? where is MH

| Weekly Rota | | Monday | Tuesday | Wednesday | Thursday | Friday |
|------------------------|----|---|---|---|---|------------------|
| Date | | 28/09/2009 | 29/09/2009 | 30/09/2009 | 01/10/2009 | 02/10/2009 |
| Duty Radiologist | am | AR | AR | WB | KR | AN |
| | pm | SB | MH | PS | MH | SB |
| CT | am | PS | MH | SB | WB | SE |
| | pm | AN | KR | MH | AR | AR |
| MRI | am | (MH) | AR | WB | MH | AN |
| | pm | SB | MH | PS | MH | SB |
| US | am | JS | AN | AN | AR | WB AR |
| | pm | AR | WB AR | WB SB | KR | AN WB |
| Reporting | am | KR AR SB | KR | PS | KR WC | KR |
| | pm | KR WC | AN | AN | WB WC | JS KR |
| Screening | am | | | MH | JS | KR |
| | pm | | | | | |
| Intervention | am | AR | WB | PS | | |
| | pm | PS | | | | |
| SPA | | WB JS (pm) | | AR KR | PS SB AN | MH PS JS (am) |
| Teaching | | | | | | |
| A/L or S/L | | | WC SB PS | WC | | |
| MDT or ClinRad Meeting | | Neuro 12.30 SB Upper GI 13.00 AR Urology KR 13.00 | Vascular 8.15 PS Urology AR 12.00 Lung 12.30 MH | Med PS 8.30 Haematol 9.30 WC Gynae 12.30 MH | Urology 8.15 AR Colorectal 8.30 MH ITU 14.00 MH | Gen Med 13.00 AR |
| Dr Banavali | SB | | Dr Harvie | MH | Dr Schnatterbeck | PS |
| Dr Bashir | WB | | Dr Newland | AN | Dr Stroudley | JS |
| Dr Curati | WC | | Dr Rafique | AR | | |
| Dr Flais | SF | | Dr Riahy (10 am) | KR | | |

PS left off the roster AM - wherever she is

| Weekly Rota Date | Monday 05/10/2009 | Tuesday 06/10/2009 | Wednesday 07/10/2009 | Thursday 08/10/2009 | Friday 09/10/2009 |
|------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|----------------------|
| Duty Radiologist | am AR pm AR | am KR pm KR | am WB pm MH | am MH pm MH | am AN pm SB |
| CT | am MH pm AR | am KR pm AR | am PS pm MH | am WB pm AR | am SB pm AR |
| MRI | am AR pm PS | am AR pm WC | am WB pm AN | am MH pm MH | am AN pm SB |
| US | am JS pm KR | am AN pm WB AR | am AN pm WB PS | am AR pm AR | am AR pm AN WB |
| Reporting | am KR pm KR | am KR pm MH | am AN WC pm MH | am WB pm WB | am KR pm JS KR |
| Screening | am | am | am | am | am |
| Intervention | am | am WB pm PS | am | am | am WB |
| SPA | am | am | am | am | am |
| Teaching | am | am | am | am | am |
| A/L or S/L | am | am | am | am | am |

| MDT or ClinRad Meeting | Monday | Tuesday | Wednesday | Thursday | Friday |
|------------------------|----------|------------------|------------------|--------------------|------------------|
| Neuro | 12.30 SB | Vascular 8.15 PS | Med PS 8.30 | Urology 8.15 AR | Gen Med 13.00 AR |
| Upper GI | 13.00 AR | Urology AR 12.00 | Haematol 9.30 WC | Colorectal 8.30 MH | |
| Urology | KR 13.00 | Lung 12.30 MH | Gynae 12.30 MH | ITU 14.00 MH | |

- | | | | | | |
|-------------|----|------------------|----|------------------|----|
| Dr Banavali | SB | Dr Harvie | MH | Dr Schnatterbeck | PS |
| Dr Bashir | WB | Dr Newland | AN | Dr Stroudley | JS |
| Dr Curati | WC | Dr Rafique | AR | | |
| Dr Flais | SF | Dr Riahy (10 am) | KR | | |

MH not in water

| Weekly Rota | Monday | Tuesday | Wednesday | Thursday | Friday |
|------------------------|---|---|---|---|------------------|
| Date | 26/10/2009 | 27/10/2009 | 28/10/2009 | 29/10/2009 | 30/10/2009 |
| Duty Radiologist | am AR pm SB | KR MH | WB MH | KR WB | AN SB |
| CT | am SB pm AN | MH KR | SB MH | WB AR | SB AR |
| MRI | am AR pm SB | SB MH | WB AN | MH MH | AN SB |
| US | am AR pm JS KR | AN WB AR | AN WB SB | AR KR | AR WB AN WB |
| Reporting | am KR pm KR | KR AR SB | JS JS | KR WB | JS JS KR |
| Screening | am pm | | MH | JS | KR |
| Intervention | am pm | WB | | | |
| SPA | WB JS (pm) | | KR AR | AN SB JS (pm) | MH |
| Teaching | | | | | |
| A/L or S/L | WC PS | WC PS | WC PS | WC PS | WC PS |
| MDT or ClinRad Meeting | Neuro 12.30 SB Upper GI 13.00 AR Urology KR 13.00 | Vascular 8.15 PS Urology AR 12.00 Lung 12.30 MH | Med PS 8.30 Haematol 9.30 WC Gynae 12.30 MH | Urology 8.15 AR Colorectal 8.30 MH ITU 14.00 MH | Gen Med 13.00 AR |

- | | | | | | |
|-------------|----|------------------|----|------------------|----|
| Dr Banavali | SB | Dr Harvie | MH | Dr Schnatterbeck | PS |
| Dr Bashir | WB | Dr Newland | AN | Dr Stroudley | JS |
| Dr Curati | WC | Dr Rafique | AR | | |
| Dr Flais | SF | Dr Riahy (10 am) | KR | | |

Letter to NHS Counter Fraud by a medical secretary that these practices have in the department as early as 1999.

Address has been removed for security

Mrs Jennifer Wynne



Counter-Fraud and Security Management Services
3 floor, Lakeside
Alexandra Park
Prescott Road
St Helens WA10 3TL

26 January 2010

Dear Sir/Madam

Re: Allegation of fraud by radiologists at Ealing Hospital

I understand the above allegation has recently been made, and would just like to add to it that while I worked in the Radiology Department at Ealing Hospital from 1999 until 2006 as Medical Secretary/PA to Clinical Director, I was aware of consultants working at other hospitals at times when they were rostered to be in Ealing Hospital. I did bring this to the attention of two separate clinical directors in Radiology.

Yours faithfully

Jennifer Wynne (Mrs)

The uncompleted work from non-attendance was being done out of hours and claimed as overtime

| | | | | |
|-----------|------------|-----|---------|-----------|
| afterbeck | 11/03/2009 | MRI | £250.00 | |
| afterbeck | 30/03/2009 | MRI | £250.00 | |
| afterbeck | 02/04/2009 | MRI | £250.00 | |
| afterbeck | 04/04/2009 | MRI | £250.00 | |
| afterbeck | 18/04/2009 | CT | £250.00 | £1,250.00 |

Revised to cover MRI - Monday AM
 - Not an additional payment
 after hours